

AB 1296 Stakeholder Meeting – May 3, 2012

Recommendations on Data Collection for Race, Ethnicity, Primary Language, Disability Status, Gender and Sexual Orientation

Introduction: California has an important opportunity to take the lead in increasing access to quality health care services and eliminating health disparities by both implementing and building upon the new federal data standards set forth under the ACA. The federal standards are a good first step; however, the tremendous diversity of our state necessitates adopting additional data categories (as recommended by the Institute of Medicine (IOM)) that better reflect the demographics of our state.¹² With the state developing a new, simplified enrollment form for online, mail, phone, and in-person enrollment, now is the ideal time to adopt new standards with minimal added expense. The tables below reflect recommendations of the California Pan-Ethnic Health Network (CPEHN), Disability Rights and Education Defense Fund (DREDF) and Equality California (EQCA) for state standards for collecting data on race, ethnicity, primary language, disability status, gender and sexual orientation.

Collecting Optional Demographic Information: Questions that deal with eligibility determinations and accessibility issues (e.g. disability status, oral interpretation, translation assistance, sex) should be considered mandatory questions asked at the front end of the application. Optional questions pertaining to demographic information (e.g. race, ethnicity, gender identity and sexual orientation) should be asked at the end of the application so as not to discourage anyone from filling out the rest of the form. A statement clarifying that the question is voluntary and will only be used to ensure equal access to quality care for everyone should be included as part of the instructions to recipients. We recommend the following statement:

***Demographic Information (optional):** Please tell us about yourself. This information is confidential and will only be used to make sure that everyone has the same access to health care. It will not be used to decide what health program you are eligible for.*

¹ “Race, Ethnicity and Language Data: Standardization for Health Care Quality Improvement,” Institute of Medicine (IOM), August 31, 2009, <http://iom.edu/Reports/2009/RaceEthnicityData.aspx>

² “The Health of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender People; Building a Foundation for Better Understanding,” Institute of Medicine (IOM), March 21, 2011, <http://www.iom.edu/Reports/2011/The-Health-of-Lesbian-Gay-Bisexual-and-Transgender-People.aspx>. For further information go to: http://books.nap.edu/openbook.php?record_id=13128&page=95

TABLE 1: Race/Ethnicity/Primary Language Data Recommendations

Race/Ethnicity/Primary Language	Recommendation(s)	Suggested Question(s)																																						
Hispanic Ethnicity	<p>OMH guidance recommends separate questions on race and ethnicity which California should adopt: “To provide flexibility and ensure data quality, separate questions for race and ethnicity should be used wherever feasible. Specifically, when self-reporting or other self-identification approaches are used, ethnicity is asked first, and then race.”³</p> <p>CPEHN recommends: Use the U.S. Census 2010 Q5. to ask about Hispanic Ethnicity followed by an accessible drop-down menu of other Hispanic Ethnicity categories not included in Q5. These should be based on U.S. Census/ACS generated data on Race/Ethnicity categories for California as shown.</p>	<p>U.S. Census Bureau Census 2010 Form http://2010.census.gov/2010census/about/interactive-form.php</p> <p>Q5 Is this person of Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish origin? <input type="checkbox"/> No, not of Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish origin <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, Mexican, Mexican Am., Chicano <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, Puerto Rican <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, Cuban <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, another Hispanic, Latino, or Spanish origin - <i>Print origin, for example, Argentinean, Colombian, Dominican, Nicaraguan, Salvadoran, Spaniard, and so on.</i></p> <hr/> <p>Drop-Down Menu (from Table 3. CPEHN Brief)</p> <table border="0"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="888 727 1115 751">Hispanic or Latino</th> <th data-bbox="1325 727 1514 751">CA Population</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>Mexican</td><td>11,423,146</td></tr> <tr><td>Salvadoran</td><td>573,956</td></tr> <tr><td>Guatemalan</td><td>332,737</td></tr> <tr><td>Puerto Rican</td><td>189,945</td></tr> <tr><td>Nicaraguan</td><td>100,790</td></tr> <tr><td>Peruvian</td><td>91,511</td></tr> <tr><td>Cuban</td><td>88,607</td></tr> <tr><td>Honduran</td><td>72,795</td></tr> <tr><td>Colombian</td><td>64,416</td></tr> <tr><td>Argentinean</td><td>44,410</td></tr> <tr><td>Ecuadorian</td><td>35,750</td></tr> <tr><td>Chilean</td><td>24,006</td></tr> <tr><td>Costa Rican</td><td>22,469</td></tr> <tr><td>Panamanian</td><td>17,768</td></tr> <tr><td>Bolivian</td><td>13,351</td></tr> <tr><td>Dominican (Dominican Republic)</td><td>11,455</td></tr> <tr><td>Venezuelan</td><td>11,100</td></tr> <tr><td>Uruguayan</td><td>4,110</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	Hispanic or Latino	CA Population	Mexican	11,423,146	Salvadoran	573,956	Guatemalan	332,737	Puerto Rican	189,945	Nicaraguan	100,790	Peruvian	91,511	Cuban	88,607	Honduran	72,795	Colombian	64,416	Argentinean	44,410	Ecuadorian	35,750	Chilean	24,006	Costa Rican	22,469	Panamanian	17,768	Bolivian	13,351	Dominican (Dominican Republic)	11,455	Venezuelan	11,100	Uruguayan	4,110
Hispanic or Latino	CA Population																																							
Mexican	11,423,146																																							
Salvadoran	573,956																																							
Guatemalan	332,737																																							
Puerto Rican	189,945																																							
Nicaraguan	100,790																																							
Peruvian	91,511																																							
Cuban	88,607																																							
Honduran	72,795																																							
Colombian	64,416																																							
Argentinean	44,410																																							
Ecuadorian	35,750																																							
Chilean	24,006																																							
Costa Rican	22,469																																							
Panamanian	17,768																																							
Bolivian	13,351																																							
Dominican (Dominican Republic)	11,455																																							
Venezuelan	11,100																																							
Uruguayan	4,110																																							

³ “Explanation of Data Standards for Race, Ethnicity, Sex, Primary Language and Disability,” Department of Health and Human Services, Office of Minority Health, Oct. 31, 2011, <http://minorityhealth.hhs.gov/templates/content.aspx?ID=9228&lv=2&lvIID=208>

		<table> <tr> <td>Paraguayan</td> <td>1,228</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other Central American</td> <td>14,719</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Other South American</td> <td>5,826</td> </tr> <tr> <td>All other Hispanic or Latino</td> <td>151,614</td> </tr> </table>	Paraguayan	1,228	Other Central American	14,719	Other South American	5,826	All other Hispanic or Latino	151,614											
Paraguayan	1,228																				
Other Central American	14,719																				
Other South American	5,826																				
All other Hispanic or Latino	151,614																				
Race	<p>HHS expands the categories of race and ethnicity: The new HHS data standards for race and ethnicity include additional granularity, but all categories roll-up to the OMB standards.</p> <p>These new categories which are based on the ACS and U.S. Census categories provide additional granularity for Hispanic (four additional categories) and Asian subpopulations (7 additional categories) beyond the OMB minimum standard categories.</p> <p>CPEHN recommends: Use the U.S. Census 2010 Question 6. on race which includes the new HHS categories.</p> <p>To reflect California's demographics under Asian add three additional checkboxes for Hmong, Cambodian and Laotian.</p> <p>Insert drop-down menus for "Asian Other" and "Pacific Islander Other" categories.</p>	<p>U.S. Census Bureau Census 2010 Form http://2010.census.gov/2010census/about/interactive-form.php</p> <p>Q6 What is this person's race? Mark one or more boxes.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> White</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Black, African Am., or Negro</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> American Indian or Alaska Native - <i>Print name of enrolled or principal tribe.</i></p> <p>_____</p> <table> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Asian Indian</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Japanese</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Native Hawaiian</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Chinese</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Korean</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Guamanian or Chamorro</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Filipino</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Vietnamese</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Samoan</td> </tr> </table> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Hmong <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Cambodian</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Laotian</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Other Asian - <i>Print race, for example, Hmong, Laotian, Thai, Pakistani, Cambodian, and so on.</i> <input type="checkbox"/> Other Pacific Islander – <i>Print race, for example, Fijian, Tongan, and so on.</i></p> <p>_____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Some other race - <i>Print race.</i></p> <p>_____</p> <p>Drop-Down Menu (from Table 3. CPEHN Brief)</p> <table> <tr> <td>Asian</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Filipino</td> <td>1,195,580</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Chinese (except Taiwanese)</td> <td>1,150,206</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vietnamese</td> <td>581,946</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Asian Indian</td> <td>528,176</td> </tr> </table>	<input type="checkbox"/> Asian Indian	<input type="checkbox"/> Japanese	<input type="checkbox"/> Native Hawaiian	<input type="checkbox"/> Chinese	<input type="checkbox"/> Korean	<input type="checkbox"/> Guamanian or Chamorro	<input type="checkbox"/> Filipino	<input type="checkbox"/> Vietnamese	<input type="checkbox"/> Samoan	Asian		Filipino	1,195,580	Chinese (except Taiwanese)	1,150,206	Vietnamese	581,946	Asian Indian	528,176
<input type="checkbox"/> Asian Indian	<input type="checkbox"/> Japanese	<input type="checkbox"/> Native Hawaiian																			
<input type="checkbox"/> Chinese	<input type="checkbox"/> Korean	<input type="checkbox"/> Guamanian or Chamorro																			
<input type="checkbox"/> Filipino	<input type="checkbox"/> Vietnamese	<input type="checkbox"/> Samoan																			
Asian																					
Filipino	1,195,580																				
Chinese (except Taiwanese)	1,150,206																				
Vietnamese	581,946																				
Asian Indian	528,176																				

		<table> <tr><td>Korean</td><td>451,892</td></tr> <tr><td>Japanese</td><td>272,528</td></tr> <tr><td>Taiwanese</td><td>96,009</td></tr> <tr><td>Hmong</td><td>86,989</td></tr> <tr><td>Cambodian</td><td>86,244</td></tr> <tr><td>Laotian</td><td>58,424</td></tr> <tr><td>Thai</td><td>51,509</td></tr> <tr><td>Pakistani</td><td>46,780</td></tr> <tr><td>Indonesian</td><td>25,398</td></tr> <tr><td>Burmese</td><td>15,035</td></tr> <tr><td>Sri Lankan</td><td>10,240</td></tr> <tr><td>Bangladeshi</td><td>9,268</td></tr> <tr><td>Nepalese</td><td>5,618</td></tr> <tr><td>Malaysian</td><td>2,979</td></tr> <tr><td>Bhutanese</td><td>694</td></tr> <tr><td colspan="2">Pacific Islander</td></tr> <tr><td>Samoan</td><td>40,900</td></tr> <tr><td>Guamanian or Chamorro</td><td>24,299</td></tr> <tr><td>Native Hawaiian</td><td>21,423</td></tr> <tr><td>Fijian</td><td>19,355</td></tr> <tr><td>Tongan</td><td>18,329</td></tr> <tr><td>Marshallese</td><td>1,559</td></tr> </table>	Korean	451,892	Japanese	272,528	Taiwanese	96,009	Hmong	86,989	Cambodian	86,244	Laotian	58,424	Thai	51,509	Pakistani	46,780	Indonesian	25,398	Burmese	15,035	Sri Lankan	10,240	Bangladeshi	9,268	Nepalese	5,618	Malaysian	2,979	Bhutanese	694	Pacific Islander		Samoan	40,900	Guamanian or Chamorro	24,299	Native Hawaiian	21,423	Fijian	19,355	Tongan	18,329	Marshallese	1,559
Korean	451,892																																													
Japanese	272,528																																													
Taiwanese	96,009																																													
Hmong	86,989																																													
Cambodian	86,244																																													
Laotian	58,424																																													
Thai	51,509																																													
Pakistani	46,780																																													
Indonesian	25,398																																													
Burmese	15,035																																													
Sri Lankan	10,240																																													
Bangladeshi	9,268																																													
Nepalese	5,618																																													
Malaysian	2,979																																													
Bhutanese	694																																													
Pacific Islander																																														
Samoan	40,900																																													
Guamanian or Chamorro	24,299																																													
Native Hawaiian	21,423																																													
Fijian	19,355																																													
Tongan	18,329																																													
Marshallese	1,559																																													
Granular Ethnicity (Ancestry)	<p>OMH guidance encourages the collection of additional granular ethnicity data as long as the additional detail can be aggregated back to the minimum standard set of race and ethnicity categories.</p> <p>CPEHN recommends: Use U.S. Census data Q 13. Include a drop-down menu of Granular Ethnicity (Ancestry) questions based on 2000 American Community Survey Ancestry</p>	<p>U.S. Census Bureau Census 2010 Form http://2010.census.gov/2010census/about/interactive-form.php</p> <p>Q13. What is this person's ancestry or ethnic origin?</p> <p>(For example: Italian, Jamaican, African Am., Cambodian, Cape Verdean, Norwegian, Dominican, French Canadian, Haitian, Korean, Lebanese, Polish, Nigerian, Mexican, Taiwanese, Ukrainian, and so on.)</p> <p>Drop-Down Menu (from Table 4. CPEHN Brief)</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>Acadian/Cajun</td> <td>Guyanese</td> <td>African</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Afghan</td> <td>Hungarian</td> <td>Other</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Albanian</td> <td>Icelandic</td> <td>Subsaharan</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Alsatian</td> <td>Iranian</td> <td>African</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>Irish</td> <td></td> </tr> </table>	Acadian/Cajun	Guyanese	African	Afghan	Hungarian	Other	Albanian	Icelandic	Subsaharan	Alsatian	Iranian	African		Irish																														
Acadian/Cajun	Guyanese	African																																												
Afghan	Hungarian	Other																																												
Albanian	Icelandic	Subsaharan																																												
Alsatian	Iranian	African																																												
	Irish																																													

	<p>data. Note: The Institute of Medicine (IOM) has recommendations for how to code Granular Ethnicity so the categories can be aggregated back to the minimum standard set of race and ethnicity categories (see IOM Report Table E-1 based on CDC codes).</p>	<p>Arab: Egyptian Iraqi Jordanian Lebanese Moroccan Palestinian Syrian Arab/Arabic Other Arab</p> <p>Armenian Assyrian/Chaldean/Syriac Australian Austrian Basque Belgian Brazilian British Bulgarian Canadian Carpatho Rusyn Celtic Croatian Cypriot Czech Czechoslovakian Danish Dutch Eastern European English Estonian European Finnish French (except Basque) French Canadian German German Russian Greek</p>	<p>Israeli Italian Latvian Lithuanian Luxemburger Macedonian Maltese New Zealander Northern European Norwegian Pennsylvania German Polish Portuguese Romanian Russian Scandinavian Scotch-Irish Scottish Serbian Slavic Slovak Slovene Soviet Union</p> <p>Subsaharan African: Cape Verdean Ethiopian Ghanian Kenyan Liberian Nigerian Senegalese Sierra Leonean Somalian South African Sudanese Ugandan Zairian Zimbabwean</p>	<p>Swedish Swiss Turkish Ukrainian United States or American Welsh</p> <p>West Indian (excluding Hispanic origin groups): Bahamian Barbadian Belizean Bermudan British West Indian Dutch West Indian Haitian Jamaican Trinidadian and Tobagonian U.S. Virgin Islander West Indian Other West Indian</p> <p>Yugoslavian Other groups</p>	
--	--	--	---	---	--

<p>Language</p>	<p>OMH guidance mandates a standard question on primary language and encourages additional granularity to record language spoken. The standard is based on the ACS, which assesses both English proficiency and language spoken other than English, and has been collected by the Census Bureau since 1980. The questions are necessary for research and clinical purposes.</p> <p>This recommendation is consistent with language recommendations from the Institute of Medicine report <i>Race, Ethnicity, and Language Data Collection: Standardization for Health Care Quality Improvement.</i></p> <p>CPEHN recommends: CA should continue asking about spoken and written language preferred.</p> <p>Add another question on language proficiency. All three questions should be mandatory as they assess accessibility and communication needs of applicants and enrollees.</p>	<p>Medi-Cal/HFP/PCIP question(s):</p> <p>What language do you want us to speak to you in?</p> <p>What language should we write to you in?</p> <p>Additional OMH Question:</p> <p><i>How well do you speak English? (5 years old or older)</i></p> <p>a. ___ Very well</p> <p>b. ___ Well</p> <p>c. ___ Not well</p> <p>d. ___ Not at all</p>
------------------------	--	---

TABLE 2. Disability Status Recommendations

Disability Status	Suggested Questions
<p>Accessibility/Communication Assessment – Mandatory Questions</p>	<p>Accessibility/Communication Assessment – Mandatory questions</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Incorporate the following questions into information requested of the person applying on their own and/or a family member/child’s behalf to enable eligibility workers to provide reasonable accommodations or modifications needed during the application process.</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If you have difficulty hearing spoken language or speaking, what translation assistance do you need for effective communication? - If you have difficulty (even with glasses) seeing, reading, or understanding written language, what alternative format do you need for effective communication? - Do you have difficulty concentrating, remembering, or making decisions due to a physical, mental, emotional, or developmental condition? • <i>A non-exhaustive list of examples of “translation assistance” and “alternative formats” should accompany the above questions, as a page link or accessible “drop down menu” from the online application, and in the accompanying instructions in paper applications. Representatives taking applications by phone should also be trained to provide the examples when assisting individuals with making a phone application. Examples of “translation assistance” include Qualified sign language interpreters, qualified notetakers, computer-aided transcription services, written materials, telephone handset amplifiers, assistive listening devices or systems, telephones compatible with hearing aids, closed caption decoders, telecommunications devices for deaf persons (TDD’s), videotext displays, speech-to-speech relay services, or other means of making oral interactions available to individuals with hearing or speech impairments. Examples of “alternative formats” include Qualified readers, taped texts, audio recordings, Brailled materials, large print materials, electronic formats, or other effective methods of making visually delivered materials available to individuals with visual or print comprehension impairments.</i> • <i>The instructions should also explain the kinds of accommodations that can be provided for someone who indicates cognitive processing difficulties due to a physical, mental, emotional, or developmental condition (e.g., appointments for in-person consultation, extended timelines for, or assistance with, gathering needed reference materials or documents, etc.)</i>
<p>Eligibility Determination – Mandatory Question</p>	<p>Eligibility Determination – Mandatory Question</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Replace wording in the current Medi-Cal, Healthy Families, and other California health subsidy program applications relating to the applicant and/or a family member/child having a “physical, mental, emotional or developmental disability” as follows:</i> Does the person have “difficulty hearing or seeing, or difficulty performing the following functions at an age appropriate level: concentrating, remembering, making decisions, engaging in common social interactions and conversation, walking or climbing stairs, maintaining motor control or holding still, dressing or

bathing, or doing errands alone.

- **Replace the “Disability expected to last” component of the disability question with “Impairment expected to last?”**

The above questions are derived from the six 2011 American Community Survey (ACS) questions relating to disability that have also been proposed in the federal Department of Health and Human Service (HHS) Notice of Proposed Rulemaking concerning the data collection requirements in Section 4302 of the Affordable Care Act (ACA). The “ACS six” describe the functional limitations that accompany disabilities rather than use the unexplained term “disability,” which has untoward connotations and stigma for many individuals. The ACS questions have been federally tested as a means of data collection on disability status, and are written out in the disability status section of the April 28, 2011 data collection letter prepared by the Leadership Conference on Civil and Human Rights, at pp. 12-13. At the same time, the ACS questions have some recognized limitations for capturing certain groups of people with speech, developmental, learning, neurological, and mental health disabilities (see August 1, 2011 letter from DREDF to HHS Secretary Kathleen Sebelius concerning data collection standards under Section 4302 of the ACA for additional information). The above questions recommended here are modified in recognition of these limitations in the ACS questions, as well as the fact that application forms require brevity.

Other Issues:

- **Use of Drop-Down Menus:** The state can choose various options for ensuring accessibility including breaking the form up into steps and displaying additional optional or related lists on a new page. This may be more accessible than a drop-down menu, particularly for those with visual impairments or manual impairments who have difficulty using a mouse. If the state chooses to use drop-down menus they must be navigable using the keyboard only and the menu selections must also be labeled in a logical manner. WebAim.org: (<http://webaim.org/techniques/forms/>) has some helpful information on ensuring accessibility. The state may also be able to use a DHTML menu like this one (<http://www.udm4.com/menu/>).

TABLE 3. Gender Identity and Sexual Orientation Recommendations

Gender and Sexual Orientation	Suggested Question(s)
Sexual Orientation	Adopt the question in development by the federal Department of Health and Human Service (HHS) Data Council, and the National Center for Health Statistics, for standardization of LGBT data collection. http://minorityhealth.hhs.gov/templates/content.aspx?lvl=2&lvlid=209&id=9004#A
Gender Identity	Some people describe themselves as transgender when they experience a different gender identity from their sex at birth. For example, a person born into a male body, but who feels female or lives as a woman. Do you consider yourself to be transgender? <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Don't know/not sure (from the Massachusetts Executive Office of Health and Human Services, Health Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System, http://www.mass.gov/eohhs/docs/dph/behavioral-risk/survey-11.pdf)